

Table 1: Comparison of Host and Phoenix Models

	‘Host’	‘Phoenix’
Positives	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Faster process which reduces uncertainty and risk thus enabling more planning pre-merger • Principal designate can be appointed quickly once the colleges agree to proceed • Existing management structure and operations can continue until the colleges are ready for the host college to restructure and integrate • New Board and organisational structure for integration of the college can be discussed in advance of the merger • This new structure can seek ‘early wins’ to prove the benefits of the proposed new college • Possibly less uncertainty for staff/management if it is perceived as the next steps in an already developed collaborative approach rather than a move to possibly unknown Board and management structure • One application to the Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator and 42 days notice and a further application (also requiring 42 days notice) to change the name of the college 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creating a demonstrably ‘new’ college, that would be very clearly perceived as a ‘new beginning’. • Conducive to lots of change and innovation. • Provides many opportunities for staff and management engagement in creating a new culture. • Requires very skilled and creative leadership. • Requires new Principal, management structure and operations
Negatives	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Could be perceived as a ‘take over’ • Could be perceived that one college is in the driving seat • Risks losing the strengths of the non-host college • Business continuity risk at the point of restructuring the college 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Slower process which increases uncertainty and risk which may require scenario planning • Risks a Board that lacks continuity and potentially loses the experience from the existing boards • It might require the Scottish Government to appoint the chair and the Board using the public appointments process which can take a substantial amount of time • Business continuity risk at the point of merger • Multiple applications to the Office of the Scottish Charity Regulator all requiring 42 days notice. Firstly, to dissolve the existing colleges and secondly to set up a new charity.
Possible steps that might mitigate some of the negatives	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Internal and external communication strategies which recognise and address the above issues – to be successful this will require significant input in terms of time, staff and resources • Joint Board events • Joint staff events • Jointly agree a new name for the college to signal a new beginning alongside an internal and external branding exercise • A significant programme of work to demonstrate the vision of the new college. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Considering whether the Board will need additional assistance in its early days e.g. co-opted existing members perhaps on a time limited basis.