

## **Independent Review of SFC's Research Pooling Initiative**

### **Process**

Professor Heathwaite was supported by an Advisory Panel and quantitative analysis by Dr Kirsty Collinge, University of Edinburgh.

SFC issued a [call for evidence](#) on 23 November 2018, inviting written submissions by noon on 18 January 2019. Evidence was sought on the impact of SFC's research pooling initiative and the lessons learnt. The call was publicised on the SFC website and directly to everyone on SFC's Research and Innovation notifications list. Personal invitations to respond were also sent out to a number of stakeholders, see list in Annex A. See Annex B for a full list of respondents.

Professor Heathwaite also invited individuals and groups to attend oral evidence sessions in March 2019. A full list of invitations is included at Annex C. See Annex D for the full list of witnesses.

Following the oral sessions Professor Heathwaite invited further written responses to targeted questions from some key stakeholders. Annex E sets out those invited and who responded.

The Advisory Panel met on six occasions in Edinburgh, and twice by teleconference. Interim findings were taken to SFC's Research and Knowledge Exchange Committee on 11 June 2019 and a meeting was hosted in the Royal Society of Edinburgh on 5 August 2019, Chaired by Dr Rebekah Widdowfield, to act as 'critical sounding board' ahead of final reporting to SFC board on 5 September 2019.

## Invited to respond to written call for evidence (blanks indicate no response)

All Principals	Responses from all institutions except Abertay, GSA, RCS, SRUC, QMU
All VPs	
All pool directors	All but SIRE
IC CEOs	4 (of 8)
US Convenor	No, but one from Universities Scotland executive
US RKEC	
UUK	
Interface	Yes
Scottish Government	
Scottish Enterprise	
Highlands & Islands Enterprise	
<b>Co-funders</b>	
Bòrd na Gàidhlig	
Chief Scientist Office,	
HIE	
CBI Scotland	
FSB	
Scottish Chambers of Commerce	
Technology Scotland	Yes
Institute of Directors	
SCDI	
SFE	
Moredun Research Institute	
James Hutton Institute	
BioSS	Yes
Rowett Institute	
Roslin Institute	
Scottish Association for Marine Science	
Centre for Ecology and Hydrology	Yes
British Geological Survey	
RSE	Yes
Royal Society	
Royal Society of Chemistry	
Royal Society of Biology	
Institute of Physics	

Royal Economic Society	
Royal Scottish Geographical Society	
Royal Academy Engineering	
Institute of Mathematics and its applications	
Marine Biological Association	
Chief Scientific Advisor (Scotland)	
Chief Scientific Advisor Marine	
Chief Scientific Advisor at the Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs.	Yes – but only in a personal capacity not from DEFRA
Chief Scientific Advisor for environment, natural resources and agriculture (Scotland)	
SepNET	
N8 Research Partnership	
Great Western Research	
Research and Innovation Strategy and Funding Sub-Group, UKRI (includes all RC directors of research, Innovate and RE)	
European Institute for Biomedical Imaging Research (EIBIR)	
European Marine Board	Yes
European Marine Biological Resource Centre	
EuChemS	
European Chemistry Society	
European Physical Society (EPS)	

**Written evidence submissions**

Green indicates a response on behalf of a research pool

Yellow indicates a response on behalf of an HEI

<b>Name</b>	<b>Job title</b>	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Pool</b>
Prof Yvan Petillot		Heriot Watt	ERPem and more recently with SRPe in Robotics
Mark Dunlop	Senior Lecturer	University of Strathclyde	SICSA
Prof Peter Edwards		University of Aberdeen	SICSA and SUPA
Ian Reid	CEO	CENSIS	Member of SICSA advisory board. Regular dealings as an Innovation Centre with SRPe, SUPA, MASTS and to a lesser extent with SINAPSE and ETP
Alessandro Laudicella	PhD Student	SAMS	MASTS
Karl Burgess	Senior Research Fellow	University of Glasgow	SULSA
Ian Phillips	Chief Executive	OGIC - the Oil and Gas Innovation Centre	ETP and SRPe
Tim Stojanovic	Lecturer in Geography and Sustainable Development	University of St Andrews	MASTS
David Sugden	Professor Emeritus	University of Edinburgh	SAGES
Sian Henley	Lecturer	University of Edinburgh	SAGES and MASTS
Alejandro Gallego	Oceanography Group Leader	Marine Scotland Science	MASTS
Michele Christian	Division Manager Natural Resources	Government of Pitcairn Islands	MASTS
Brice Rea	Professor	University of Aberdeen	SAGES
Ian Ritchie	Chairman	Tern plc	SICSA and SUPA
Ian Miguel	Professor, Director of Research	University of St Andrews	SICSA

Sandy Cochran	Professor / Deputy Head of School	University of Glasgow, School of Engineering	SUPA, SRPe, SINAPSE
Anon 1	Working in industry		SICSA
Moya Crawford	Managing Director	Deep Tek Limited	MASTS
Clare El Azebbi	Head of Cyber Resilience Policy	Scottish Government	SICSA
Una McCarthy		Marine Scotland Science	
Lynsay Shepherd	Lecturer in Usable Security	Abertay University	SICSA
Linsey Dickson	Head of Research Development & Performance	University of Stirling	Pooling general
David Harrison	Professor of Pathology	University of St Andrews	SINAPSE
Tom Cowton	Lecturer	University of St Andrews	SAGES
Richard Heard	Programme Director	INSITE Programme	MASTS
Miguel Nacenta	Senior Lecturer	University of St Andrews	SICSA
Conchúr Ó Giollagáin	Director of Soillse, University of the Highlands and Islands Gaelic Research Professor	Soillse – The National Research Network for the Maintenance and Revitalisation of Gaelic Language and Culture	Soillse
Stephen Taylor	CEO	Technology Scotland	SUPA, SULSA, SINAPSE
Neil Simco	Vice-Principal Research and Impact	University of the Highlands and Islands	
Stuart McElroy	Director of Biosciences	BioAscent Discovery Ltd	SULSA
Sir James Hough	Professor	University of Glasgow	Pooling general
Gillian Docherty	CEO	The Data Lab	SICSA, MASTS, SAGES, SUPA, ETP

Denise Barrault	Executive Director	NPSC	SULSA
Amjad Ullah	Research Associate	University of Westminster, London	SICSA
Mark Brewer	Director	Biomathematics and Statistics Scotland	Pooling general
John Colin Adams	Consultant	University of Edinburgh	SICSA
Mark Inall	Director SAGES, Professor in Marine Physics	SAMS-UHI	SAGES
Brian Quinn	Professor of Ecotoxicology	University of the West of Scotland	MASTS
Mary Daly	Acting Deputy Director, Strategy and Planning	Glasgow Caledonian University	SICSA, SUPA, Soillse
Stuart Reid	Professor	University of Strathclyde	SUPA
Victoria Gradin	Profesora Adjunta (Grado 3)	Universidad de la Republica - Montevideo - Uruguay	SINAPSE
Tanita Casci	Head of Research Policy	University of Glasgow	All pools
George Corner	Hon Professor (ret Consultant Medical Physicist)	University of Dundee (Past NHS Tayside)	SINAPSE
Jasmina Lazic	Chief Data Technologist - Bayes Centre	University of Edinburgh	SICSA
Sheila Heymans	Executive Director	European Marine Board	MASTS
Scott Lilley	ScotCHEM Director of Training and Pooling	ScotCHEM	ScotCHEM
Helen Kennedy	Senior Manager Research	University of the West of Scotland	SUPA, SAGES, SRPE, ETP, MASTS, SICSA
Pauline Jones	Head of Strategic Performance and Research Policy	University of Edinburgh	partners in majority of the funded research pools
Marlis	Senior Policy	University of Aberdeen	All pools

Barraclough	Advisor		
Robin Shields	Senior Innovation Manager	Scottish Aquaculture Innovation Centre (SAIC)	MASTS
Derek Woollins	Vice Principal (Research & Innovation)	University of St Andrews	MASTS, ETP, ScotCHEM, SAGES, SINAPSE, SICSA, SULSA, SUPA, EastCHEM
Peter Liss	Emeritus Professor	University of East Anglia	MASTS and SAGES
Lynne Baillie	Director of Research School of Mathematical and Computer Science	Heriot-Watt University	Heriot-Watt University
David Donaldson	Professor and Head of Psychology	University of Stirling	SINAPSE
Greg Michaelson	Emeritus Professor of Computer Science	Heriot Watt University	SICSA
Wen-Yih Isaac Tseng, Md, PhD	Director	National Taiwan University Molecular Imagine Centre, National Taiwan University College of Medicine	SINAPSE
Norman Turner ACMA, CGMA	Head of Research & Innovation Office	Edinburgh Napier University	SULSA
Professor Paul Hagan	Vice-Principal Research	Robert Gordon University	Pooling general
Dr Claire Goll�ty	Ma�tre de conf�rences en �cologie marine Lecturer in marine ecology	Centre universitaire de formation et de recherche de Mayotte	MASTS
Ruth Meyer, Senior Policy	Senior Policy Officer (Research and Innovation)	Universities Scotland	Pooling general

Officer (Research and Innovation)			
Dr Ken Sutherland	President	CANON MEDICAL RESEARCH EUROPE	SINAPSE and SUPA
Dr. Allison Jackson	Executive Director	Scottish Universities Life Sciences Alliance	SULSA
Prof John Rowan Daniela Bolle	(VP Research) (Head of Research Development)	University of Dundee	Most of the pools with the exception of CHEM and MASTS
Dr Andrea Szymkowiak	Senior Lecturer in Human Computer Interaction School of Design & Informatics   Division of Cyber Security	Abertay University	SICSA
Dr David McBeth	Director, Research & Knowledge Exchange Services	University of Strathclyde	Pooling general
Ian Boyd		University of St Andrews	Pooling general
Heather Rattray (née Alexander)	Marketing Manager	Interface	Pooling general
Ian Sommerville	Emeritus Professor of Computer Science	St Andrews University	SICSA
David Wyper	Director of SINAPSE from 2010 to 2017	University of Glasgow	SINAPSE
Dr Alexey Goltsov PhD	Lecturer	School of Science, Engineering & Technology	SICSA



DSc(Habil) FHEA		Abertay University	
Steven Kendrick	SICSA Executive Officer	University of Glasgow	SICSA
Stephen-Mark Williams	Executive Director, Energy Technology Partnership	University of Strathclyde	ETP
Prof Alison Murray Dr Kristin Flegal	SINAPSE Director SINAPSE Lead Scientist	University of Glasgow and University of Aberdeen	SINAPSE
Dr Caroline Cantley	Executive Director	Scottish Research Partnership in Engineering Technology & Innovation Centre	SRPe, ERPem, GRPe, NRPe
Paul Stuart	Policy Advice Officer	RSE	Pooling general
John R Underhill	University Chief Scientist	Heriot Watt University	Pooling general
David Paterson	Executive Director, MASTS	University of St Andrews	MASTS
Professor Alan Miller	Director, SUPA	University of Glasgow	SUPA
Antony Weir	Head of Policy, Strategy & Impact, Research Engagement	Heriot Watt University	Pooling general
Professor David Paterson			On behalf of all pools.
Anna Dominiczak	Glasgow Vet & Life sciences		
Ian Halliday	Emeritus Professor	University of Edinburgh	SUPA

### Invitation to oral evidence session

	Role	Attendance	Nominate
Dr Stuart Fancey	Director, R&I, SFC	Yes	
Professor Paul Hagan	Previous director R&I, SFC	Yes	
Professor David Gani	Previous Director RPS, SFC	Yes	
Professor Lesley Yellowlees	Chair, SFC's Research & Knowledge Exchange Committee	Yes	
Professor Peter Holmes	Previous Chair of SFC's RKEC	Timetable issue	
Roddy MacDonald	Head of Higher Education and Science Division, Scottish Government Advanced Learning and Science Directorate	Nominate	Claire Woodward-Nutt  Greg Moschonos
Professor David Crossman	Chief Scientific Officer	Nominate	Dr Alan McNair (Chief Scientist's Office, Senior Research Manager)
Professor Andrew Millar	Chief Scientific Adviser for Environment, Natural Resources and Agriculture	Nominate	Dr Liam Kelly (Head of RESAS: Research, Sponsorship and Business Unit, Scottish Government) Not available to attend due to timetabling issues
Professor Sheila Rowan	Chief Scientific Adviser	Not available	
Professor Colin Moffat	Chief Scientific Adviser Marine		
Professor Ian Boyd	Chief Scientific Adviser Department for Environment, Food and	Not Available	

	Rural Affairs		
Graham Black	Director, Marine Scotland		
Shona MacLennan	Ceannard (CEO), Bord na Gaidhlig	Not available Nominate not available	
Clare El Azebbi	Head of Cyber Resilience Policy SG		
Professor Paul Boyle	Chair, SSAC	Not available	
Young Academy, RSE	Invited to nominate students/ ECRs		Chih-Chung Tseng
			Nikolay Ogryzko
			Madeleine Seale
			Dr Stephen P Thomas
Alison Munro	Scottish Enterprise	nominate	Ian Blewett
Morven Cameron	Highlands & Islands Enterprise	Yes	
Siobhan Jordan	Interface	Yes	
Professor Gavin Gibson	Vice-President, Edinburgh Mathematical Society	Yes	
Professor Roibeard O Maolalaigh	Vice Principal and Head of College Humanities, Glasgow	Not available	Responded to targeted questions instead
Professor Anne Anderson	Vice-Principal and Head of College Social Sciences, Glasgow	Not available	Responded to targeted questions instead
Dame Anne Glover	President, RSE	Nominate	Professor Julian Jones
Hayaatun Sillem	CEO, Royal Academy Engineering		
Robert Parker	President, Royal Society Chemistry		
Gillian Docherty,	CEO, The Data Lab.	Yes	
Ian Phillips	CEO, Oil & Gas IC	Yes	
Paul Winstanley	CEO, Censis	Nominate	Graham Kerr Technical Director

			Train cancelled
Heather Jones	CEO, Aquaculture	Timetable issue	
Alastair Sim	Universities Scotland	Not available	
Professor Graeme Reid	Science and Research Policy, University College London	Not available	
Professor David Ulph	Previous Director SIRE research pool	Yes	
Professor Ian Halliday	Former Director SUPA		
Professor Ian Somerville	Former Director SICSA		
Professor David Sugden	Former Director, SAGES		
Andrew Thompson	Executive Chair, AHRC		
Lyn Gladden	Executive Chair, EPSRC		
Jennifer Rubin	Executive Chair, ESRC		
Fiona Watt	Executive Chair, MRC		
Duncan Wingham	Executive Chair, NERC		
Mark Thomson	Executive Chair, STFC		
Melanie Welham	Executive Chair, BBSRC		
Helen Fletcher	UKRI Director of International Development GCRF - Challenge Leader		
Ian Campbell,	Interim Executive Chair Innovate UK	Not available Nominate not available	
Gregor McNie	Head of External Affairs (Devolved Nations), CRUK	Timetable issue	
Beth Thompson	Head of UK/EU policy, Wellcome	Not available	
Chris Hale	Director of Policy, UUK		
Professor George Boyne	Principal, Aberdeen	Nominate	Dr Liz Rattray (Director of Research and Innovation)
Professor Nigel Seaton	Principal, Abertay	Nominate	Professor Nia White (Dean of

			Research and the Graduate School)
Professor Andrew Atherton	Principal, Dundee	Nominate	Danielle Bolle (Head of Research Development)
Professor Peter Mathieson	Principal, Edinburgh	Nominate	Professor Jonathon Seckl (Vice Principal)
Professor Andrea Nolan	Principal, Edinburgh Napier		
Professor Sir Anton Muscatelli	Principal, Glasgow	Nominate	Professor Jonathan Cooper (Vice Principal International Knowledge Exchange)
Professor Pamela Gillies	Principal, Glasgow Caledonian		Professor Mike Mannion, Assistant Vice Principal (Academic)
Professor Irene McAra-McWilliam	Principal, Glasgow School of Art		
Professor Richard Williams	Principal, Heriot Watt	Nominate	Gareth Pender (Deputy Principal (Research and Innovation))
Professor Clive Mulholland	Principal, UHI	Nominate	Professor Neil Simco (Vice-Principal Research and Impact)
Professor Petra Wend	Principal, Queen Margaret	Nominate	Dr Richard Butt – Not available
Professor John Harper	Principal, Robert Gordon University	Nominate	Professor Paul Hagan (Vice Principal)
Professor Jeffrey Sharkey	Principal, RCS		
Professor Sally	Principal, St Andrews	Nominate	Professor Derek

Mapstone			Woolins (Research & Innovation)
Professor Wayne Powell	Principal, SRUC	Nominate	Professor Eileen Wall (Head of Research)
Professor Gerry McCormac	Principal, Stirling	Nominate	Dr John Rogers (Executive Director of Research and Innovation Services)
Professor Sir Jim MacDonald	Principal, Strathclyde	Nominate	Professor Tim Bedford (Vice Principal)
Professor Craig Mahoney	Principal, UWS	Nominate	Professor Ehsan Mesbahi, (Vice Principal and Pro Vice Chancellor (Academic))
Professor Alan Miller	Chief Executive Director, SUPA	Yes	
Professor Mike Barrett	Director, SULSA	Yes	
Professor Alison Murray	Director, SINAPSE	Yes	
Dr Caroline Cantley	Executive Director, SRPe	Yes	
Stephen-Mark Williams	Director, ETP	Yes	
Dr Bill MacDonald	Chief Executive Officer, ScotCHEM	Yes	
Dr Scott Lilley	Director of Training and Pooling, ScotCHEM	Yes	
Professor Rod Murray-Smith	Interim Director, SICSA	Yes	
Steven Kendrick	Executive Officer, SICSA	Yes	
Professor David Paterson	Executive Director, MASTS	Yes	
Professor Mark Inall	Director, SAGES	Yes	
Professor Conchúr	Director, Soillse	Not available	

Ó Giollagáin			
--------------	--	--	--

## Witnesses

SFC session 1	
Dr Stuart Fancey	Director of Research & Innovation (2016 – present)
Professor David Gani	Director of Research & Innovation at SFC from 2002 to 2009
SFC session 2	
Professor Lesley Yellowlees	Chair of SFC’s Research and Knowledge Exchange Committee.
Professor Paul Hagan	Director of Research & Innovation at SFC (2010 – 2015)
Pool session 1	
SIRE	Professor David Ulph, Previous Director
Pool session 2	
SUPA	Professor Alan Miller Chief Executive Officer
SINAPSE	Professor Alison Murray, Director
SULSA	Professor Mike Barrett, Director
Pool session 3	
ScotCHEM	Dr Bill MacDonald, CEO Dr Scott Lilley, Director of Training and Pooling
SICSA	Rod Murray-Smith, Interim Director Steven Kendrick, Executive Officer
SRPe	Dr Caroline Cantley, Executive Director
ETP	Dr Stephen-Mark Williams, Executive Director
Pools session 4	
MASTS	David Paterson, Executive Director
SAGES	Mark Inall, Director
Institutions set 1	
Edinburgh	Jonathon Seckl
St Andrews	Professor Derek Woolins
Aberdeen	Dr Liz Rattray
Glasgow	Professor Jonathan Cooper
Institutions set 2	
Strathclyde	Professor Tim Bedford
Heriot Watt	Gareth Pender
Dundee	Danielle Bolle
Stirling	Dr John Rogers
UHI	Professor Neil Simco
GCU	Professor Mike Mannion
Institutions set 3	
Abertay	Professor Nia White



RGU	Professor Paul Hagan
SRUC	Professor Eileen Wall
Royal Society of Edinburgh	
Professor Julian Jones	
Non-pooled area	
Professor Gavin Gibson	Vice-President of <a href="#">Edinburgh Mathematical Society</a>
Innovation Centres	
Gillian Docherty,	CEO, <a href="#">The Data Lab</a> .
Ian Phillips	CEO, <a href="#">Oil &amp; Gas IC</a>
Scottish Government	
Dr Alan McNair	Chief Scientist's Office
Claire Woodward-Nutt	Higher Education and Science Division, Scottish Government
Greg Moschonas	Higher Education and Science Division, Scottish Government
Students/ Early Career Researchers	
Chih-Chung Tseng	SULSA
Nikolay Ogryzko	SULSA
Madeleine Seale	SULSA
Dr Stephen P Thomas	ScotCHEM
Enterprise Agencies/ Interface	
Dr Siobhan Jordan	Director, <a href="#">Interface</a>
Morven Cameron	Head of Universities, Education and Skills, Highlands & Islands Enterprise.
Ian Blewett	Head of Digital Economy, Scottish Enterprise

## Targeted invitations to submit written evidence

Invited	Response
Royal Society of Chemistry	Yes
Royal Academy Engineering	
Scottish Government	Yes
Professor Anne Anderson (Social Sciences)	Yes
Professor Roibeard O'Maolalaigh (Art & Humanities)	Yes
Business Organisations	
ILGs (circulated via Scottish Enterprise)	Peter Black, EnergySYS Chemical Sciences Scotland ILG Life Sciences Scotland ILG Opito
Chief Scientific Adviser for Environment, Natural Resources and Agriculture	Yes
Moredun Research Institute	
James Hutton Institute	Yes
Rowett Institute	
Roslin Institute	Yes
Scottish Association for Marine Science	